

- of M 11 in FE; both sources end slur on note 6 of M 12 due to shortage of space.
- 17 ff.: This section is very different and incomplete in A1, where it is written as a separate piece (possibly the middle section of Étude II) with the heading *Quasi Trio*. – Some grace-note slurs are missing in the sources.
- 24 l: FE postpones *legatissimo* to beat 1 of M 25; however, see M 117.
- 38 l, 133 u: EC and FE postpone beginning of slur at end of measure to main note; however, see related passages.
- 44 u: In A2 Schumann crossed out grace note to note 7 in parallel passage M 137. Perhaps he overlooked it here.
- 44 l: EC has a pencilled (non-autograph?) $\frac{1}{2}$ on *d* together with a question mark; however, there is no $\frac{1}{2}$ in A2, nor in CM or FE, nor in the parallel passage M 137.
- 50 ff.: Some grace-note slurs are missing in the sources; we add them for the sake of consistency.
- 52 u: Staccato on beat 1 occurs only in EC.
- 78: *ff* is found only in EC and FE, where it already occurs on the penultimate note; however, see beginning of staccato marks.
- 81 l: EC and FE give notes 6–7 with *c* instead of *eb*; probably wrong line of staff in EC, for A2 and CM distinctly give *eb*; see also M 174.
- 89 l: FE lacks *ab* in chord 2.
- 117 u: Staccato marks missing in FE.
- 129 u: FE gives \rhd instead of $>$.
- 135 f., 137 f. u: EC and FE end slurs over bar line on final note of each measure; however, see M 133 f. and parallel passage in M 42 f. and 44 f.
- 136 u: EC gives note 1 as *bb*² instead of *bb*¹; traces of correction in FE.
- 138 u: \llcorner occurs only in EC; FE gives $>$ in parallel passage M 45.
- 149 l: *sf* missing in FE.
- 154 l: Both *sf*'s missing in EC.
- 156 f. u: Slur missing in FE.
- 158 l: First *sf* missing in EC. – In the parallel passage M 65 Schumann later added a grace note *f* on eighth note *a* in the mar-

gin of EC. Perhaps he forgot the addition here.

160 u: *sf* missing in FE.

168 l: Final staccato missing in FE.

174: EC and FE postpone *ff* until after double measure; however, see M 81.

184: See comment on M 10.

191: EC has staccato on each note 1; ignored in our edition since not found elsewhere.

Appendix

We have taken CM as our primary source. We do not report later changes to A1 in A2, or those to A2 in CM. However, we adopt signs from A1 or A2 when it is safe to assume that their absence from CM was inadvertent.

Variation I

Called *Var. 3* in CM, but crossed out.

1 f., 4 l: Slur occurs only in A1.

1 f., 9: Dynamic marks occur only in A1.

6: Final *sf* occurs only in A2.

13 l: CM gives octave on beat 1 as ♩ with subsequent rests ($\frac{3}{4}$ $\frac{3}{4}$ $\frac{3}{4}$); probably a misreading of A2 rather than an alteration by Schumann.

16 l: CM gives final note without lower octave; A2 only indicates *8^{va}*, leaving it open whether *con 8^{va}* is intended or the note should be played an octave lower. Schumann used *8^{va}* in both senses.

Variation II

Called *Var. 4* in CM.

1: \llcorner and *sempre Pedale* occur only in A1.

1–3 u: In the grace notes, A2 clearly distinguishes between ♩ at the beginning of a measure and ♩ at the end. CM has ♩ and ♩ ; accented upbeat probably intended when used on a half note.

2 u: Only A1 places $\frac{1}{2}$ on note 7 B.

9 u: A2 and CM mistakenly give final three quarter notes as eighth notes.

9–12 l: A2 and CM incorrectly give triplets as 32nd notes instead of 16th notes.

13 u: A2 has staccato marks on the three grace notes before the final note.

17: Final measure occurs only in CM, where it was added later by Schumann.

Variation III

Called *Var. 6* in CM.

Variation IV

Called *N° 10* in CM.

Tempo given as *Adagio* in A1, which however differs markedly from the version in A2 and CM. A1 also has expression mark *espressivo* in M 1 and > on first six notes of head motif.

1–4 u: Slur occurs only in A1 and A2.

6 l: First half note $g^{\sharp 1}$ taken from A2, where it is slightly indistinct due to correction.

CM mistakenly gives $f^{\sharp 1}$ instead of $g^{\sharp 1}$.

14 u: A2 and CM mistakenly give sextuplet as 16th-note sextuplet.

20 f. u: Slur on e^1 – b^1 over bar line occurs only in A2.

21 f. l: Slurs occur only in A2.

24–27 u: Slurs occur only in A2.

26 f.: < and *p* occur only in A2.

40 l: CM gives note 2 as E_1 instead of $G^{\sharp 1}$; probably a mistake, for it does not derive from Schumann's correction. A1 gives $G^{\sharp 1}$ – $F \times (!)$ – $G^{\sharp 1}$ in the related passage in M 38–40.

56 l: CM gives C^{\sharp}/G^{\sharp} on beat 1; probably a mistake, for it does not derive from Schumann's correction.

56b: A2 gives an empty bracket $\overline{\quad}$ for *seconda volta*, with a pencilled instruction to the copyist: *Platz zu 2*, i. e. he should leave space for two measures of *seconda volta* because Schumann was evidently still uncertain how to handle it. The one-measure version reproduced in small print is taken from the complete edition *Robert Schumann's Werke*, published by Clara Schumann 1879–93.

Variation V

The middle section of *Var. 7* in CM.

This variation was originally written out as a self-contained variation in A2. It was then

redefined to function as the middle section of *Étude X*, which was meant to be repeated *da capo*. The original mark in A2, *l'istesso tempo* (later crossed out), thus refers to the tempo of *Étude X*.

5–8: Still quite different in A2; altered by Schumann in CM.

14 l: CM gives note 3 as bb^1 instead of db^2 .

Unfinished Variation

First published in Wolfgang Boetticher, *Robert Schumanns Klavierwerke*, part 2, op. 7–13, Wilhelmshaven, 1984, p. 255. Reprinted with kind permission of Florian Noetzel Verlag, Wilhelmshaven.

Called *N° 8* in CM.

The end of the variation has an instruction to the copyist: *Platz zu zwei Linien* (space for two lines). Both A2 and CM actually leave two staves blank at the end of this variation. It has been conjectured that Schumann simply wanted the first eight measures repeated after M 11. If so, he probably would have provided an instruction to this effect. At the least he was uncertain how to continue.

Symphonic Études op. 13

Version 1852

Sources

EdS Schuberth print. Hamburg etc., Schuberth, plate number 1525, published in February 1852. Metronome marks in Variations III, IV, VII and VIII enclosed in parentheses. Title: *ETUDES / en forme de / Variations / POUR LE PIANOFORTE / dédiées à son ami / WILLIAM STERNDALÉ BENNETT / par / Robert Schumann*. [left:] *Œuvre 13* [right:] *Prix 1 1/3 Rthr / Edition nouvelle revue par l'Auteur / Propriété des Editeurs. / Schuberth & Comp. / HAMBOURG, LEIPSIC & / NEW-YORK. / [Title-page lithograph by] T. Jucksch sc.*

& sc. in *Hambourg*. Copy consulted: London, British Library, shelfmark h.88.o.(8.).

- EdH Haslinger print of 1837 (see source FE for version of 1837).
 Sch Edition by Adolf Schubring; date in preface: 20 March 1861.
 EC Engraver's copy for 1837 version (see source EC for version of 1837).

About this edition

EdS was quite obviously prepared from a copy of EdH. This means that many of the errors in EdH (see *Comments* on the 1837 version) were also transferred to EdS. Therefore, as in our edition of the 1837 version, we have corrected the errors in the 1852 version on the basis of the handwritten sources.

The copy of EdH used in the preparation of EdS no longer survives, but it was available to Schubring for his edition of 1861. According to Schubring, the instruction "Everything in same size" appeared alongside the theme. This instruction was ignored by the engraver: the notes accompanying the theme were engraved in small print, as in EdH. However, as the annotation in EdH referring to the author of the melody was discarded, this notational distinction was now meaningless.

Signs that are missing in the sources but that are musically necessary or legitimated through analogy have been placed in parentheses.

Individual comments

Theme

- 9 l: EdS extends slur to beat 1 of M 10.

Variation I

- 7 u: EdS has slur on notes 1–5 ($c\sharp^1-d\sharp^1$); slurring already corrupt in EdH.
 8 u: EdS has slur on notes 1–2. Perhaps notes 2–3 were intended, as in the parallel passage in M 16. (As music was engraved from right to left in mirror inversion, such mistakes were always possible; see errors

in M 16 l.) This would explain why the staccato is missing on note 3 although it appears in left hand.

- 9 l: Staccato marks taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 10f. u: The division of the chord at the final quarter-note value of M 10 into quarter notes plus eighth notes with a tie on d^2-d^2 is taken from the autograph; all the later sources stem b^1/d^2 with the octave g^1/g^2 .
 11 u: Tie on c^2-c^2 occurs only in EC; see also comment on this passage in *Étude I* of 1837 version.
 12 u: Tie on e^1-e^1 taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 14 l: Staccato on note 4 occurs only in EC.
 15 u: EdS mistakenly starts slur on note 4 $c\sharp^1$.
 l: Penultimate note $c\sharp$ taken from autograph; notated as eighth notes in EdH and EdS; tie missing in EdS.
 16 l: Slur from 1st $c\sharp^1$ to d^1 is engraver's error in EdS.

Variation II

- 8a l: Staccato taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 11 l: 2nd slur occurs only in EC; missing in EdH and hence in EdS.
 12f. l: Grace note at end of measure corresponds to 32nd note in right hand; the associated slur to note 1 of M 13 is missing in EdH and EdS, probably because EC only gives the continuation of the slur after a line break.
 14 l: \llcorner taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 16a: Staccati occur only in EC.

Variation III

- l l: EC starts slur a bit too far to the left; hence slur incorrectly starts on beat 1 in EdH; however, see related measures.
 8a l: EdS gives chords 3–4 as $\sqrt{\text{J}}$, i. e. without the J found elsewhere. See also comment on this passage in *Étude IV* of 1837 version.
 9ff.: Some grace-note slurs are missing in EdS.

Variation IV

- 1–3 u: Last staccato but two in lower voice of each measure taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 3 u: Staccato 5 in upper voice and staccato 6 in lower voice taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 4 l: Staccato on note 3 taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 6 l: Staccato 1 taken from EC, staccato 5 from EdH; both missing in EdS.
 8 l: > occurs only in EC.
 9 l: Staccato on last note but two taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 10 u: Staccato marks 2–5 taken from EC; missing in EdS.
 13 u: Staccato 4 taken from EC; missing in EdS.
 13 l: Staccato occurs only in EC.
 14 u: Staccato marks 1–2 in left hand taken from EC; missing in EdS.
 15 u: Staccato 6 taken from EdH; missing in EdS.

Variation V

- 6 l: Staccato on penultimate note taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 8a l: 3rd ^ taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 8b: EdH and EdS postpone *p* to beat 1 of M 9.
 13 l: Fourth ^ taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 15 u: Slurs in middle voice occur only in EC.
 16b l: ^ on note 6 occurs only in EC.

Variation VI



- 1 l: *Pedale* occurs only in EC.

Variation VII

- 3 u: Slur from M 2 ends on note 1 in EdS and EdH. As so often, the 2nd slur is drawn a bit too vigorously beyond the final note (by Schumann?) in EC, and hence in EdH itself, until it was finally extended to beat 1 of M 4 in EdS. – In lower voice > taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 3 l: Staccato 2 occurs only in EC.

- 5 u: Slur stops at end of measure in EdS; however, see related passages and EdH.
 7 l: EdS ends slur at note 8; however, see related passages.
 15 u: > taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 17 u: EdS ends long slur on $b\sharp^2$; however, see M 15f. and EC.

Variation VIII

- EdS has  throughout the entire piece instead of 
 3: 1st *sf* taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 3 l: According to information in Sch, Schumann reversed the order of the final three notes in the proof copy for EdS to read $e^1-d\sharp^1-c\sharp^1$ instead of $c\sharp^1-d\sharp^1-e^1$. If so, the correction was ignored by the engraver.
 7: EdH and EdS give *f* instead of *sf*; however, EC gives *sf*; see also M 15.
 12 l: EdS starts 1st slur on note 1; however, see subsequent articulation and EdH.
 12 u: EdS starts long slur on note 5; however, see other articulation in this measure and EdH.

Variation IX

- 1 l: With the deletion of the introductory measure the pedalling instruction also inadvertently disappeared in EdS. The pedal should, of course, be used throughout the piece.
 11 l: < occurs only in EC.
 15–17 u: Slurring taken from EC; see comment on 1837 version, *Étude XI*, M 16–18.
 17 l: Slurs taken from EC; missing in EdS and EdH.

Finale

- See *Comments* on the 1837 version regarding the articulation marks in the main theme.
 3 u: Staccato marks on notes 3–4 taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
 11f.: Slur in middle voice divided between M 11–12 in EdS owing to line break; all sources end slur on note 6 of M 12 due to shortage of space; same applies in M 93 and 174.

- 17 ff.: Some grace-note slurs are missing in the sources.
- 33 l: A2 and CM place *pp* on the dotted bass figures on beat 1.
- 37 l: Staccato marks 1–3 taken from EC; missing in EdS.
- 44 u: In the autograph, Schumann deleted the grace note to note 7 in the parallel passage (M 125). Left standing here by mistake?
- 48 l: Staccato 1 occurs only in EC.
- 52 u: Staccato 1 occurs only in EC.
- 59, 63 u: Only EdH gives 1st *sf* in these two measures.
- 68 l: EdS ends slur on note 4; however, see adjoining measures and EdH.
- 73 l: Staccato on final note taken from EC; missing in EdS.
- 73–75 u: Articulation marks taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
- 78: EdH and EdS already place *ff* on penultimate note; EdS also starts staccato marks on that note. This resulted from a misreading of EdH: the engraver construed the left hand staccato marks in M 74 as belonging to the right hand of M 78, which lies directly beneath it in EdH.
- 81 l: EC, and hence EdH, give notes 6–7 with *c* instead of *eb*; probably a slip to a lower staff space, for the preceding handwritten sources distinctly read *eb*; error adopted by EdS; see also M 162.
- 82: < taken from EdH; missing in EdS.
- 95 l: Slur taken from EdH (M 107); missing in EdS.
- 98 l: Slur taken from EdH (M 110); missing in EdS. Note 2 mistakenly given as *db*² instead of *eb*² in EdS.
- 117 u: > taken from EC (M 129); missing in EdS.
- 133 l: *sf* taken from EdH (M 145); only *f* in EdS.
- 142 u: *f* taken from EdH (M 154); missing in EdS.
- 144 u: EdH (M 156) places \natural on final note; omitted in EdS, possibly by mistake.
- 145 u: EdS postpones beginning of long slur to beat 1 of M 146; however, see related passages and EdH.
- l: *sf* taken from EdH (M 157); missing in EdS.
- 146 l: Writing in the margin of EC, Schumann later added a grace note *f* to the eighth note *a* in the parallel passage (M 65); he may have forgotten the addition here in M 146 (M 158 of EdH).
- 148 u: *sf* occurs only in EC (M 160); see also M 150.
- 155 l: Staccato marks 1–2 taken from EdH (M 167); missing in EdS.
- 155 f. u: Articulation marks taken from EdH (M 167 f.); missing in EdS.
- 156 l: > taken from EdH (M 168), final staccato taken from EC; both missing in EdS.
- 158 l: Slur on notes 1–2 occurs only in EdH; missing in EdS.
- 159 f.: Staccato marks taken from EC (M 171 f.); missing in EdS.
- 162: Staccato taken from EC (M 174); missing in EdS. – EdS postpones *ff* to beat 1 of M 163.
- 163, 175 u: EdS places 2nd slur above three notes; see general comment on articulation marks in main theme preceding the comments on Étude XII of the 1837 version.
- 167: Slur in left hand and staccato at end of measure taken from EdH (M 179); missing in EdS.
- 170 u: Final staccato taken from EdH (M 182); missing in EdS.
- 171: Staccato marks taken from EC (M 183); missing in EdS.
- 173 l: Slur to next measure postponed to final note; however, see M 11 and 92.
- 174 f. l: Slur in lower middle voice taken from EdH (M 186 f.); missing in EdS.

Major departures from the 1837 version

Time signature C instead of C throughout entire piece.

Theme

7 u: Middle voice syncopated in 2nd half of measure.

Variation I (Étude I)

7 u: *ritenuto* deleted.
 12 l: Triplets in upper octave of bass line deleted.
 15 u: Last chord altered.

Variation II (Étude II)

7, 15 l: Grace notes added to penultimate note in each measure.
 8, 16 l: 1st octave in prima and seconda volta an octave lower.
 16 l, seconda volta: Grace note on final chord deleted.

Variation V (Étude VI)

1: *con gran bravura* deleted.

Variation VI (Étude VII)

1 ff., 19 ff.: \wedge in right hand instead of *ten.* in right hand and left hand.
 3 f.: *p* and *f* deleted.
 13, 16: *rinforzando* deleted.
 21: *pp* only in EdH; however, see \llcorner .

Variation VIII (Étude X)

Con energia sempre deleted.
 3 u: ♯ ♯ instead of double repetition of chord 5.
 12 l: Chord 1 lacks *b*.
 17 l: Slurs occur only in EC (M 18) for EdH; missing in EdS.

Variation IX (Étude XI)

Introductory measure deleted.
 1 u: *Con espressione* instead of *sotto voce, ma marcato*.
 1–9: Repetition with prima volta.

Finale (Étude XII)

2, 14, 83, 164: *p* deleted. As it is missing in all four passages, the omission of *p* is probably intentional, even if it was reinstated in all four measures in Clara Schumann's complete edition *Robert Schumann's Werke*.
 17: *preciso* deleted.

44 l: Whole note *bb*.
 80 f., 162: Alternative reading.
 84 f.: Completely different reading with dynamic mark *p*.
 90–94: Alternative version, 12 measures shorter.

Remagen, autumn 2006
 Ernst Hertrich

Piano Sonata in f minor op. 14**Version 1836: Concert sans****Orchestre****Sources**

- A1 Autograph. Bonn, Universitätsbibliothek, shelfmark Schumann 2. 2 sheets; contain parts of Scherzo I (beginning of the Trio, 8 measures, dated 14 April 36), Scherzo II (M 17–21) and from the slow movement: Theme (in **C**; title: *Pensées* *Pensées sur* —), Variation 1 (in $\frac{2}{4}$), Variation 2 (M 1–29 in **C**) and Variation 4 (M 1–16 in **C**, dated 14 April 36).
- A2 Autograph. Vienna, Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde, shelfmark A 285. One sheet; contains parts of Scherzo II (M 1–54 and 76–114) and the first version of the finale (M 1–8; title: *Passion*); in addition, 8 further measures that cannot be allocated to any specific work.
- A3 Autograph. Stockholm, Stiftelsen Musikkulturens Främjande, Sammlung Nydahl, shelfmark MMS 1300. 2 sheets, 4 written pages of music; contain a version of the final movement that is strongly divergent.
- A Autograph. London, British Library, shelfmark Ms. Add. 37056. Title page (inserted later): *Concert / pour Piano seul / composé / et / dédié / à / Mr. Ignace Moscheles / par / Robert Schumann.* / [left:] *Oeuw. 14. Schu-*

mann later notated the new version of M 193–221 of the final movement on the verso of the sheet with the (crossed-out) original title (*Grande[?] Sonate / für / das Pianoforte / Herrn I. Moscheles / zugeeignet / von / Robert Schumann. / Op. 14*). On sheet Ir Schumann added in the lower margin: *Der Verfasser bittet um Aufbewahrung des Manuscriptes, das noch andere Stücke enthält* (The composer requests the safekeeping of the manuscript, which also contains other pieces); in the right margin Haslinger added: *H. Schönwälder / Dieses Concert nehmen Sie / sogleich in Arbeit. / 17. Juni 1836* (Mr. Schönwälder, proceed immediately with this concerto. 17 June 1836). The manuscript contains five movements:

1st movement · *All^o Brillante*.

2nd movement · *Scherzo I^o. Vivacissimo*. This Scherzo remained unpublished in Schumann's lifetime (see appendix).

3rd movement · *Promenade / Scherzo 2^a. Promenade Scherzo. / Intermezzo*. This Scherzo II was first included in the version of the work published in 1853 as *Grande Sonate*.

4th movement · *Quasi Variazioni*. Variations notated in the following sequence: Theme [crossed out], [Var:] I, II [crossed out = appendix, Var. a], III [next to this, from Schumann: (*bleibt III*)], IV [next to this from Schumann: (*wird II*)], V [crossed out = appendix Var. b], VI [next to this from Schumann: (*wird mit IV bezeichnet*)].

5th movement · *Prestissimo possibile*.

Passionato. Before this, a crossed-out page which contains the beginning of the version from A3.

The manuscript has many corrections and a number of paste-overs, and served as the engraver's copy for

FECO, as is evident from several annotations made by the engraver.

FECO First edition. Vienna, Tobias Haslinger, plate numbers p. 2 “(6954.)”, pp. 3 ff. “T.H. 6954.”, published in September 1836. Title: *CONCERT SANS ORCHESTRE / pour le / Piano-Forte. / DEDIE' / A' MONSIEUR IGNACE MOSCHELES / par / Robert Schumann. / Oeuvre 14. / Propriété de l'Editeur. / [left:] N^o 6954. [right:] Prix $\frac{fl-2.30x C.M.}{T.1.16gr.}$ / Enregistré dans l'Archive de l'Union. / VIENNE, / chez Tobie Haslinger, / Marchand de Musique etc. de la Cour I. [Imperiale] et R. [Royale]. Copy consulted: Schumann's personal copy, Zwickau, Robert-Schumann-Haus, shelfmark 4501/Bd. 2-D1/A4.*

FESO First edition of the *Grande Sonate* (version of 1853). See the source description in the *Comments* there.

About this edition

Our primary source was the first edition FECO, which was examined and corrected by Schumann. As usual, however, he overlooked many minor errors, which can be discovered by comparing the print with the autograph A. For this reason, A must also be seen as an important source for this edition. The two autograph sketches A1 and A2, on the other hand, are hardly relevant.

Signs that are missing in the sources but that are musically necessary or legitimated through analogy have been placed in parentheses.

Individual comments

I Allegro brillante

3, 115: In A \llcorner for entire measure; however, in FECO it is notated at neither place and was probably rejected by Schumann.

5–7 u: In A $\text{♩ } bb^1-c^2, bb^2-c^3, f^3-e^3$ slurred; however, in FECO slurs not notated at parallel passage at M 231–233.

- 10 l: * at different places here and at the analogous passages in A, FECO: M 10 on 2nd beat, M 122 on 3rd, M 128 not at all, but on 2nd beat of M 129. The question remains as to where Schumann actually wanted the *, but one can probably assume that the same place was always intended. The reason for the cancellation of the pedal was presumably not the change of harmony, since *Pedale* applies from M 2; instead, it must have been the staccato of the right hand; the prescription *Pedale* returns after the staccato notes are over. For this reason, the * has been consistently placed to match M 122 at all three passages.
- 11 l: 1st note an octave higher in A, the result of an earlier, corrected reading in which the preceding 16th notes were notated in a higher position.
- 13–16 u: Mostly for reasons of space, only 1st–3rd notes of the motif slurred here and at the analogous passages in the sources, though sometimes the 1st–2nd and 3rd–4th notes are also separately slurred.
- 18 u: In FECO slur from M 17 extends only to 1st note; but see also M 20.
- 20 u: Staccati missing in FECO.
- 27 l: Appoggiatura note *g* only in FECO; not yet notated in A. The two left hand staccati missing in FECO.
- 35 l: Fingering numbers *l l* on 3rd and 4th notes of the middle voice in A.
- 38 l: In FECO *Bb–eb* and *Bb–Eb* slurred; in A deleted? Not adopted, as singular occurrence.
- 38–57: The short slurs are often missing at the dotted figures here and at analogous passages in the sources, especially in FECO; not listed specifically.
- 42 l: 1st–2nd chords slurred in FECO; not adopted, as singular occurrence; possibly a slip resulting from the mirror-image engraving, since the connecting slur to the beginning of M 42 is missing between M 41f. at the change of page.
- 44f.: Dynamic markings running in opposite directions for right hand and left hand taken from A, where both hairpins are notated between the staves; In FECO however, < and > each extend over half a measure in M 45, which makes little musical sense; the engraver apparently did not know what to do with the strange marking in A.
- 46ff.: Staccato on the 1st note of the chromatically descending dotted-note motifs is sometimes missing here and at the parallel passage at M 166ff. in one of the sources; not specifically listed.
- 47ff. l: Long slur begins only in M 48 in A because of change of line after M 47; borrowed as such from FECO, FESO; but see parallel passage at M 167ff.
- 50: > missing in FECO; but see analogous passage at M 170.
- l: > only in A; in FECO probably omitted solely for reasons of space.
- 51f. l: A originally had long slur extending to 1st note of M 54; later, short slur comprising *g^b–f* was entered, and long slur deleted from there onwards. The engraver of FECO mistakenly assumed that entire slur had been deleted. But see right hand.
- 56f. l: In both sources slur *A–B^b* at change of measure; not adopted, as singular occurrence.
- 58f. l: In FECO *f–eb–c* slurred instead of tie *G–G*. Engraver's error. Similarly in M 73, where *a–bb–db¹* are also mistakenly slurred where there should be a tie *f–f*.
- 62: *animato* in FECO in capital letters above the brace; in A, however, only at left hand; but see also parallel passage at M 182.
- 62–65, 182–185 l: In A, Schumann removed the chords and notes supplied with > from the eighth-note beaming; in M 62 he indicated: *Diese Köpfe ohne Striche* (These heads without lines), i.e. presumably without note stems. Neither FECO nor FESO took up this instruction. Perhaps it was intended to indicate a special use of the pedal at these notes.
- 70f. u: Length of slur in upper voice irregular and unclear here and at the analogous passages in the sources: In A, slur at M 70f. is not continued between the two measures after the change of line; in FECO

- it extends to 1st note of M 71; in M 71–73 it reaches to the end in middle voice in A, but in FECO only up to 1st note of M 73; M 190f. end of slur unclear in A; in FECO up to 3rd note of M 191; M 191–193 up to after the 1st note of M 193 in A; in FECO only up to last note of M 192. Clearly, the same is always intended; the length of the slur in the lower voice suggests that the slur includes the 4th note each time.
- 71–73 u: Slur in middle part ends at 1st note of M 73, probably for reasons of space; see comment on M 70f.
- 72–76 l: Long slur from A; apparently overlooked by engraver of FECO since it was drawn very horizontally and runs into the staff lines. See parallel passage at M 192ff.
- 73 l: See comment on M 58f.
- 76–83: These measures are completely different in A; the material from M 42–49 is repeated a fourth higher (M 76–79, 80–83 contain the same musical material as M 42–45, 46–49). The model for the altered version in FECO has been lost; it must have been written on an extra sheet that was pasted into A. Rests of glue can still be clearly discerned in A. Amazingly, FESO then takes up some of the rejected version of A again, by having M 76–79 repeat the material of M 42–45; M 80–83 then, however, repeat M 76–79 (one octave lower), as in the version found in FECO.
- 87f. u: Slur at f^1-e^1 at the change of measure only in A; missing in FECO.
- 88f. u: The quarter-note stems are all missing in FECO; but see parallel passage at M 208f.
- 93f. u: Slur at middle voice in FECO only up to 1st note of M 94; but see M 92 and 214.
- 96 u: In A > on 1st beat; also at parallel passage at M 214f.; there also in FECO. Not adopted, since tie makes it rather illogical.
- 98 l: In A > on 1st G/d; but not found at parallel passage at M 218 in FECO.
- 100 l: * only in A; missing in FECO.
- 106 u: In A *sf* on 1st beat.
- 107f. u: < missing in FECO.
- 110 u: *sf* only in A; but see *sf* at left hand in M 111.
- 113f. l: In A slur as in M 11f.; missing in FECO, also at parallel passage at M 227f., probably because the right-hand chords are marked *sf* and intended to be played detached both times.
- 115: See comment on M 3.
- 118f. l: Slur in FECO from $\text{G}\flat$. In A two slurs, above and below the ascending quarter-note line, both originally from $\text{G}\flat$; at the lower slur, Schumann crossed out the beginning, however, and put a staccato on the note $\text{G}\flat$ instead (same correction also in M 124). The engraver only took up the upper slur, which Schumann had left intact and uncorrected. In M 124 the beginning of the slur is identical in both sources; even if the staccato is missing at both passages in FECO, this detached articulation is clearly intended each time.
- 122, 128 l: See comment on M 10 for the position of the *.
- 122f., 128f.: Staccati missing in FECO.
- 123, 129 l: In A at M 123 tie between $F\sharp_1-F\sharp_1$ and staccato at 2nd octave; similarly in M 129. In FECO correction traces can still be made out.
- 131 u: < only in A; missing in FECO.
- 137, 139 u: Staccati only in A.
- 140 l: Fingering numbers 1 4 in A on 1st and 2nd 16th notes.
- 148ff. u: In FECO one unbroken slur up to 1st note of M 152; probably because of unclear notation at change of line between M 150f. in A; but see M 30f.
- 154 u: New slur in A, FECO starts from 2nd note; space problems in A; see the analogous passages.
- 166, 170 l: Slur from 1st beat at both places in A; in FECO found only in M 170, there also from 1st beat; but see parallel passages at M 46 and 50.
- 167–170 l: Long slur in FECO divided at transition to M 168f., probably because of the change of line at the passage in A; but see M 47–50.
- 174f. l: Slur at change of measure only in A; missing in FECO.

- 183 l: 2nd > from A; missing by error in FECO.
- 187 f. l: The two shorter slurs are missing in FECO.
- 188 f. u: In FECO slur divided between both measures; but see left hand and parallel passage at M 68 f.
- 191, 193 u: See comment on M 70 f.
- 192 u: In FECO erroneously > instead of <.
- 196–203: See comment on M 76–83. Version in A diverges in the same way here (though M 203 crossed out).
- 210 f. u: Each 2nd > missing in FECO.
- 220 l: 1st note in FECO ♮ instead of ♯; perhaps because ♯ missing in A; see also parallel passage at M 98.
- 221 u: Slur at change of measure only in A, for reasons of space only up to 1st note in M 222.
- 224 l: *sf* missing in FECO.
- 231 u: Division of slur from A, in FECO divides at change of measure; but see left hand.
- 234–249: In A notated on extra sheet; original close only four measures long. In A tempo marking *Più Allegro*; the editor assumes that Schumann cancelled the marking for FECO; it is also not found in FESO.

II Quasi Variazioni

Information on the sequence of the variations can be found in the description of the autograph A at the beginning of the *Comments*. Schumann obviously considered having the movement start immediately with Variation I, since he crossed out the theme and, before Variation I, inscribed the movement heading *Quasi variazioni* before adding, in parentheses, *Melodie de Clara Wieck*. This was followed by the instruction for the engraver: *Die verschiedenen Variationen bitte ich ohne Systemabsätze hinter einander anzuschließen* (I would like you to please place the individual variations consecutively, one after the other, without setting them in dif-

ferent braces). He apparently wanted to weaken the impression of a variation movement with individual variations set off individually from one another. At the end of Variation I and II, however, there are fermatas above and below the closing bar lines, which seem to contradict this.

Andantino de Clara Wieck

Original metronome marking in A ♩ = 104, thus significantly faster.

- 1 l: * at the beginning of the movement probably means that one must play without using the pedal until the indication *Pedale* in M 17.
- 9, 13 l: A has slur from 1st to 2nd octave each time; it is not notated in either place in FECO, however, and is also missing in the right hand.
- 17–20 l: Slur analogous to M 21–24; in A from 2nd beat of M 18, in FECO from first beat of M 18, in each instance probably for reasons of space.

Variation I

- 26 l: *f* missing in FECO.
- 37, 39, 41, 43 u: In A, FECO ♮ at the 2nd chord notated on one stem with the octave, without a separate quarter-note stem, but also without extension dot; tie in M 41 f. shows what is intended.
- 37–40 l: In A tenuto strokes below each chord; instruction *sostenuto sempre* crossed out, however, though retained in FECO: there, instead, no tenuto strokes.
- 39 u: In A > also on 1st beat.
- 42 l: In A fingering number 1 at the two upper notes of the 1st chord.

Variation II

- 45 f. l: Slur extending to 1st beat of M 46 taken from A; likewise at M 50, 61, 70 and 74. The editor concludes that the engraver did not realise that the goal-tones c² and c¹ were to be reached from below and above. Unfortunately, this elegant touch was omitted in FESO and in FECO.

63, 67 u: In A staccati on the two g^1/g^2 octaves each time.



65 u: In A fingering numbers *1 4* at the octave ab^1/ab^2 and *1 2* at the fifth c^1/gb^1 .

Variation III

81 l: In A f/c^1 instead of $f/d b^1$; traces of correction in FECO.

84 u: > only in A; but see M 91.

85 l: In A staccati at all four notes instead of the two quarter-note stems.

88, 90 u: In A upper voice ; in FECO ; Schumann probably added the 16th-note beams at a later date, while correcting FECO, and forgot to delete the extension dot behind the 2nd note.

91: 2nd and 3rd notes right hand and 3rd note left hand from FECO; in A right hand $b-c^1$, left hand *f*. In FESO Schumann recorrected back to the version of A.






92 u: Short slur at end of measure from A; missing in FECO.

94 u: Long slur from A; only up to penultimate note d^1 in FECO and then in FESO; in A somewhat unclear.

101 f. u: The three > only in A; Schumann reinserted them in FESO, so they were probably only mistakenly omitted in FECO.



Variation IV

105 l: *pp* only in A; but see M 124.

107 f., 126 f. u: In A 4th and 5th chords originally notated as  in all four measures, but corrected to  in M 107 and 126; reproduced as such in M 126 in FECO, but in M 107 original version retained, albeit with false bass alignment: last chord of right hand () over penultimate chord of left hand (). FESO has  in all four measures.

111a u: > only in A.

118 u: In A slurring of $db^1/db^2-d^1/d^2$; \ddagger before the 2nd octave probably added later.

l: in A fingering numbers *3 2 1 1* on  $gb-bb-db^1$ and  gb^1 .

120: < from A; the engraver of FECO placed < above and below the staves respectively owing to lack of space between

the staves, but instead of being given the same length, they were placed in a staggered position, which gave rise to a pseudo-polyphony in the dynamics, which was adopted by FESO as well.

121 l: The two short slurs only in A; missing in FECO; but see M 110.

125 u: > from A, though a bit short there; hence > in FECO.

142 f.: The two closing measures in A subsequently changed to



Correction from FECO ignored, however.

III Prestissimo possibile

Metronome marking in A: 6/16 = 108.

2 f.: < missing in FECO.


5 f., 7 f. u: A slurs two measures each time, and four at M 13–16; likewise at M 336 f., 338 f., but not at M 654 f. and 656 f. Apparently a later change in FECO.

5–8 u: > only in A; see parallel passage at M 336–339, where in A > has been crossed out, however.

14 f.: < not in A; unclear in FECO whether it was supposed to have been deleted or whether it is reproduced a bit too weakly in the print. The engraver of FESO considered it as valid.

16: *p* only in A.

25, 356 u: Rhythmic notation from A; in








FECO ; in FESO as in A and broken down as a quadruplet within the measure, which seems perfectly plausible in view of the following measure.

29–31 u: The marking \lesssim here and at the analogous passage at M 360–362 (FESO M 15 f. and 181 f.) is perhaps intended to indicate a particularly accented portato.

33 l: A has extra fingering number *1* on Bb .

41–47 u: Long slur in A, FECO, FESO di-

- vided into two slurs: 4 + 3 \downarrow ; but see all analogous passages; divided slur found again only in FESO at M 290–293, there 3+4 \downarrow ; but drawn as one sole slur there (M 578–584) in FECO. One unbroken slur was probably always intended here.
- 42, 44 l: Staccato only in A.
- 45 l: In A *sf* on 1st beat; not adopted, as singular occurrence; possibly also crossed out.
- 57 ff. l: Position of the indication *Pedale* here and at the analogous passages in A, FECO, FESO is concordant in each instance, but inconsistent: At M 57 and 262 (see comment on M 263) at the beginning of the bass line; M 388 ff., 594 ff., 610 ff. at the change of harmony in M 391, 596, 612; at M 279 ff. *Pedale* is missing completely (originally in M 281, but crossed out there) and is notated at the end of the phrase instead, in M 286. In the musical text *Pedale* is placed according to the sources. The position at the change of harmony may seem more logical; it should be remembered, however, that the indication *Pedale* does not mean that the pedal is to be used at this point, but that one is to play “with pedal” from this point on. The position was thus not standardised, but reproduced according to the sources.
- 69 u: 1st note from A; in FECO \downarrow instead of \downarrow
- 86, 89 l: In FECO \downarrow instead of \downarrow ; in A somewhat unclear in M 86; but see also M 417, 420.
- 94 f. l: Tie *eb–eb* deleted or crossed out here and at the analogous passage at M 150 f. in A – but not at the parallel passages at M 102 f., 158 f., 166 f., 433 f., and 489 f.; not found at all in M 425 f. and 481 f. FECO, FESO give basically two ties, but they are lacking in M 102 f. and 433 f. there; in FESO also in M 246. The sources thus offer no clues as to what is actually intended. In A, one could be tempted to see a certain regularity in the fact that Schumann always notated (or accordingly corrected) only one tie the first time in each instance (M 94 f., 150 f., 425 f., 481 f.), and always two the second time (M 102 f., 158 f., 433 f., 489 f.). Musically, however, this distinction hardly makes any sense; moreover, the marking at each second position is exactly the contrary in the two prints (no ties in M 102 f., 433 f.).
- The editor has opted for the marking with only one tie at all analogous passages. This decision has been influenced by Schumann’s corrections in M 94 and 150, which he did not carry out at the other passages, perhaps only through oversight. The repeated playing of the lower octave makes sense in view of the more short-winded pedal effect of the pianos of that time.
- 96 f. u, 100 f. l: \llcorner according to the analogous passages (M 427 f., 435 f., 483 f., and 491 f.); here and in M 441 f. all three sources mistakenly have \lrcorner instead of \llcorner .
- 99 u: 1st note *f*² in FECO $\downarrow \gamma$; in A originally — , note and rests notated later (by Schumann?); but see M 107 as well as M 430, 438. In M 146, 154 and 486, 494, however, $\downarrow \gamma$ each time in both sources. FESO corresponds to FECO in each instance.
- 110 f. l: In A here and at M 166 f. slurring of *c*²–*bb*¹ and *g*¹–*f*¹; in M 166 f. in FECO one can still discern traces of the slur that was originally notated there but then deleted.
- 110–117 u: The marking of the passage is inconsistent in the three sources: instead of the opening \llcorner in M 110 f. (FESO M 56), \lrcorner is notated in M 166 f. (M 84) and 441 f. (M 222) (M 84 missing in FESO); moreover, A, FECO also have \llcorner in M 499 f. It can be assumed that the same effect was intended at all four passages; Schumann frequently confuses \llcorner and \lrcorner . Because of the *diminuendo* beginning in M 112 and the descent of the top notes that begins with it (M 110–117: *d*³–*c*³–*bb*²–*ab*²), the editor has opted for \llcorner . In several measures the \lrcorner are missing in one source or another, which, however, is not listed specifically.

- 113f. u: Separation of the slur at change of measure in FECO, probably because of the change of page between the two measures.
- 114, 116 l: In FECO, not in A, staccato on 1st beat each time; not adopted, as singular occurrence and contrary to the slashes which are probably intended to suggest a very close connection where a genuine legato is not possible.
- 118–137: Hairpins here and at the analogous passages in A, FECO placed very inconsistently and often missing; full marking only at M 449–468 in A. This passage has thus been taken as the model for the marking of all analogous passages.
- 119, 121 u: In A staccato on 1st note here and in many analogous measures; omitted, since consistently lacking in FECO, which means it was probably corrected by Schumann.
- 127, 129 u: Staccato on 2nd note missing in FECO.
- 136f. l: \leftarrow from A; in FECO mistakenly \rightarrow .
- 160f. l: Chord on 1st beat at M 160 in A, FECO notated as  with the corresponding rests in M 160f. Tied over to the next measure in all analogous passages, however. The error is already found in A, where, probably as a consequence of the 6/16 metre, the sustained chord of the left hand was broken off one measure too soon by the composer.
- 166–173 u: See comment on M 110–117.
- 179 l, 183 u: Staccati missing in FECO.
- 186–189 u: Slur in FECO extends over all the measures; but see the analogous passages.
- 202–204 l: Articulation of this passage and all parallel passages in A marked very carefully as: ; but already notated consistently as:  in FECO and, correspondingly, in FESO as well. Longer slurs in A at M 230f. and 234f. as well as 561f. and 565f., but the detached articulation is apparently intended to be maintained in these measures as well; see the fingerings at M 230f. and 234, which are also found in FECO, FESO. The fact that this fingering was also adopted in FECO, FESO suggests that Schumann simply overlooked the simplification made by the engraver.
- 218 l: *Pedale* from A; missing in FECO.
- 221 l: * in A, FECO one measure later, probably by error; but see all analogous passages.
- 222–228 u: In A one single slur over all 7 measures; in FECO slurs in the upper voice. What is intended is more likely the slur at the motivic figures () , similarly to the parallel passage at M 553–559 and at other analogous passages.
- 229 u: Separate eighth-note stem only in A, but see also FESO.
- 233 l: Staccato only in A, > only in FECO; but see M 564.
- 234 l: A has finger number 3 on 1st and 3rd notes each time.
- 239 u: In A *f* at right hand. Even if it is missing in FECO, FESO, it is clear that the *pp* marking here and at the parallel passages is intended only for the left hand.
- 248, 250 l: Staccato missing each time in FECO.
- 263 l: *Pedale* one measure earlier in the sources; simply written before the entry in A, where the left hand was originally notated in the upper staff. See also comment on M 57 ff.
- 269 u: 2nd note with \natural ? At the parallel passage at M 600 a sign similar to a \natural was later added (by Schumann?).
- 288f. l: Octave notated as  at M 288 in A (which has additional *E^b*) and FECO, but without subsequent rests; only *e^b2* on first beat of M 289. In A, however, ties to the right. At the parallel passage at M 619f.  (in FESO ). In M 288f. the \natural probably obstructed a notation of the octave that is to be tied above and notated in ♩ .
- 298 u: *vivacissimo* only in FECO.

- 363 u: In A fingering numbers 1 1 2 on 1st, 4th and 5th notes.
- 364 u: < in A, FECO one measure later; but see analogous passages.
- 373 l: Octave $G\flat/g\flat$ notated as $\text{♩} \gamma$ in FECO; but see all analogous passages.
- 425–430 u: Slur in FECO extends only up to chord in M 429; but see analogous passages.
- 433 f. l: Tie f – f missing in FECO.
- 441–448, 497–504 u: See comment on M 110–117.
- 499 f. u: In A, FECO mistakenly < instead of > ; but see the analogous passages.
- 505 f. u: In FECO staccati on bb^2 – a^2 – d^3 ; not adopted, as singular occurrence.
- 505–508 l: Slurs from A; in FECO one continuous slur.
- 549–552 l: Long slur only in A; see analogous passage at M 218–221.
- 561: f for both staves from A, FECO; also borrowed as such by FESO; at the parallel passage at M 230, however, f only at left hand, p at right hand.
- 594–596 u: In each instance, a^b should be placed before the 4th note, analogously to the parallel passage at M 263–265 and FESO.
- 604 f. l: In FECO, FESO < ; not adopted, as singular occurrence.
- 613 l: See comment on M 57 ff.
- 617 f. l: rfz and > only in A; see M 286 f.
- 639 u: 4th and 5th notes in FECO eb^2 – db^2 ; they could also be read as such in A, but see parallel passage at M 318. In FESO, at all events, analogous to the parallel passage db^2 – c^2 .
- 649: 9th fifth f/c^1 of left hand in small print is missing in A and correctly added in FECO. At the penultimate group, however, there must be an error in both prints: In A the penultimate group ends with the third d^1/f^1 for the right hand and the last group begins thusly. This would be totally out of line with the context, however; for this reason, a third $c^{\sharp 1}/e^1$ for the left hand was added at the beginning of the last group in FECO, FESO. It is more likely, however,

that Schumann simply miscounted the third d^1/f^1 at the end of the penultimate group, so wrote down one third too many. Although most editions reproduce the version of FECO, FESO, the editor has decided to omit the third d^1/f^1 from A and not to include the third $c^{\sharp 1}/e^1$ from FECO, FESO. This way, the sequence of emphases beginning with the third d^1/f^1 remains intact.

- 650: *Tempo I^o* only in A; missing in FECO, FESO, but makes sense after the *rall.* in the preceding measure.
- 658 u: 2nd note in all three sources f^1 instead of ab^1 ; but see the analogous passages at M 9 and 340.
- 664–666 u: > only in A each time; see M 676–678.
- 684 f. l: Slur only in A; but see M 672 f.

Appendix

Scherzo

- Only found in A; there directly after the 1st movement (see source description).
- 4 u: c^2 in A notated as ♩ ; but see the parallel passages at M 47, 111, and 154.
- 23: In A four measures between the 5th and 6th eighth-note values (= repetition of M 20–23 one octave higher) crossed out in ink; above this, in pencil, the word *gilt* (valid). The complete edition *Robert Schumann's Werke*, published by Clara Schumann 1879–93, thus inserts these four measures. The “valid,” however, refers to the entire page, which is also crossed out, but only lightly, in red crayon. The four measures are no longer notated in the recapitulation.
- l: In A staccato on 4th note; not adopted, as singular occurrence.
- 26 u: The open ties are probably intended to suggest a sustaining of the chord; likewise at M 30, 34, 38, 133, 137, 141, and 145.
- 54–57 u: Divergent position of the accents from M 15–17 in this manner from A; however, see also M 161–164.

60: The *sempre tenuto* refers to the eighth notes which echo the melody of the left hand and – as is shown by the quarter-note stem at the 2nd note *c*¹ – are to be played as quarter notes.

90 l: The open tie calls for the sustaining of the *C* (with pedal), which cannot be sustained on account of the *ab*.

97 u: *g*¹ from A; the complete edition Robert Schumann's *Werke* notates *a*¹ instead, analogously to M 65.

Two Variations

Contained only in A; there originally Variations II and V, which were later crossed out (see source description).

Variation a

1, 3, 5, 7 u: ♯ in the 2nd chord in A notated each time on one stem with the octave, without any separate quarter-note stem and without extension dot; likewise at M 23, 25, 27; only in M 21 is there an extension dot at the middle note *g*². See the comment on *Variation I*, M 37, 39, 41, 43.
21–24 u: Slur in A extends only up to 1st beat of M 24.

Variation b

4: *Seconda volta* not notated in A; however, it is necessary because of the discrepant continuation.
12 u: *f* in A begins on 1st beat in M 13 because of the change of line between M 12f. At the upbeat note, a slur begins in A which, however, is not continued after the change of line.

Piano Sonata in f minor op. 14 Version 1853

Sources

A1–A3, A, FECO See the source descriptions in the version of 1836.
FESO First edition. Hamburg etc., Schubert, plate number 1690, published in July 1853. Title: *GRANDE / SONATE / pour le / PIANOFORTE / dédiée / à / MONSIEUR IG-NACE MOSCHELES / par / ROBERT SCHUMANN* / [left:] *Op 14* [centre:] *Deuxième Edition* [right:] *Pr 2 Thlr.* [centre:] *Propriété des Editeurs / SCHUBERTH & C^o / Hambourg, Leipzig & New York* / [left:] *Paris, Brandus & C^o* [right:] *London, Graue & C^o.* Copy consulted: Schumann's personal copy, Zwickau, Robert-Schumann-Haus, shelfmark 4501/Bd. 21-D1/A4.

About this edition

The edition of the sonata version of op. 14 is problematic in that the immediate source for the first edition is no longer extant. This must have been a corrected copy of FECO for the 1st, 3rd and 4th movements. As for the Scherzo, Schumann must have had a new manuscript source made. As a comparison with A reveals, FECO contains a considerable number of errors and inaccuracies. When Schumann prepared a copy of this version as the source for the new engraving of FESO, he made a great number of substantial changes, especially in the 1st movement, but apparently did not pay particular attention to a corrective reading of the passages that were to remain unchanged. Thus many errors from FECO found their way into FESO. One had to begin by considering not the text of FECO, but the text edited on the basis of A and FECO as the source for the passages which remained intact. Moreover, one constantly had to consider whether divergent readings were due to Schumann or were attributable to the negligence of the engraver (of FESO). Obvious errors in FESO

(for example the occasional absence of signs and symbols) are not specifically mentioned in the following notes.



Signs that are missing in the sources but that are musically necessary or legitimated through analogy have been placed in parentheses. The fingerings in italics were supplied by Schumann; for the most part, they are already present in A.

Individual comments

I Allegro

Compared with FECO, the tempo marking is changed (no longer *brillante*) and the metronome marking is slower.

2 u: In A, FECO > on last note; probably missing deliberately in FESO, since also missing at the analogous passages. Possibly also applies to > on last note of M 3.



9f., 10f. l: Slurs here and at several analogous passages in FESO, partly also in A or FECO, only extend up to last ; it can be assumed that the same phrasing (slur extending to last ) is always intended.

10 l: See comment in version of 1836 for the position of the * here and at the analogous passages. Signs missing entirely in M 128 in FESO.

12 l: *pp* from A, FECO; in FESO only *p*; but see parallel passage at M 130.

13–16 u: See comment in version of 1836 for the slurring here and at the analogous passages.

20 u: Portato dots from A; missing in FECO and accordingly also in FESO; see the analogous passages.

22, 24 l: Note *d*¹ on 2nd beat in A, FECO also additionally notated as ; since in FESO only  is notated at the parallel passage at M 142, 144, this must be an intentional correction.

24ff. l: In A, FECO * at the beginning of M 26, *Pedale* at the beginning of M 31; in FESO only mistakenly missing?

26f. l: Notation of the continuous eighth notes *g*¹ as such in all three sources; but see also M 146f.

27 l: Staccati only in A.




28ff. u: Slurring here and at parallel passage at M 148ff. from A, where the slurs are always notated very carefully, notably always beginning anew at the start of each new ascending line. Unsatisfactorily reproduced already in FECO and with further discrepancies in FESO.

31 l: Beaming of the last three notes as such in all three sources; but see also M 151.

32f. l: In FESO division of slur between both measures; probably because there is a change of page at this passage in FECO.

35 l: A has fingering number *l* at 3rd and 4th notes of the middle voice.

38: In all three sources slurring *Bb–eb/Eb* for left hand, while A, FECO also have slurring of *bb–ab–g* for right hand; since this slurring is missing at all analogous passages in FESO, it must have been added to the left hand mistakenly here.

44f.:  for right hand and simultaneously  from A; in FECO misunderstood by the engraver and reproduced in half-measure lengths in M 45 as ; reproduced as such by FESO.

46f. u: Slur at change of measure missing in FESO.

46ff.: Staccato on the first note of the chromatically descending motifs in dotted notes is sometimes missing here and at the parallel passage at M 166ff. in one of the sources; not specifically noted.

47ff. l: See comment in version of 1836 for the beginning of the long slur.

50 l: > only in A; in FECO omitted probably for reasons of space and thus also not in FESO.

51f. l: See comment in version of 1836 for the slurring.

54: In A, FECO *mf* from *Bb*; since in FESO not notated at the parallel passage at M 174 either, it was not adopted. But it also cannot be excluded that the *mf* was only mistakenly omitted because of the newly added *sf* (instead of the original >).

- l: < only in A; missing in FECO and, accordingly, in FESO; it is found, however, at the parallel passage at M 174 in FESO.
- 56f.: In FESO < missing in M 56 l, > in M 57 u. Since M 56f. are not marked identically, but each have a contrary marking, one can conclude that there was negligence on the part of the engraver.
- l: In all three sources slur *A-Bb* at the change of measure; not adopted, as singular occurrence.
- 59 u: < only in A, > only in A, FECO; since both signs are found at the parallel passage at M 179, their absence here in FESO is probably an oversight.
- 60f.: In FESO > on last note of left hand at M 60 and on 1st note of right hand at M 61; both mistaken interpretations of short > in FECO.
- 62–65: See comment in version of 1836.
- 68f.: Slur in left hand from A; in FECO, FESO, divided between the two measures, probably because of the change of staff; but see also right hand as well as parallel passage at M 188f.
- 70f. u: See comment in version of 1836.
- 72–76 l: Long slur from A; apparently overlooked by the engraver of FECO, since drawn very horizontally and running together with the staff lines. See parallel passage at M 192 ff.
- 76–83: See comment in version of 1836.
- 87f. u: Slurring of *f*¹–*e* at change of measure only in A; missing in FECO, FESO.
- 88f. u: The quarter-note stems are all missing in FECO, FESO; but see parallel passage at M 208f.
- 96 u: In A > on 1st beat; also at parallel passage at M 214f.; there also in FECO, FESO. Omitted since tie makes it rather illogical.
- 100 l: * from A; missing in FECO, FESO; but see *Pedale* in M 88.
- 116f. u: In FESO, slur is divided between the two measures, probably for reasons of space.
- 118f. l: See comment in version of 1836 for the articulation.
- 122 l: See comment on M 10 in version of 1836.
- 124f. u: Slur in FESO in both measures extends only to end of measure. Slur at M 124 placed as such in FECO as well – probably because not continued in M 125 in A after change of page between the two measures.
- 128 l: See comment on M 10 in version of 1836.
- 131 u: < only in A; missing in FECO, FESO.
- 137, 139 u: Staccato only in A each time.
- 148 ff. u: See comment on M 28 ff.
- 151–155 l: Slur in FESO extends only to end of M 152; in FECO in M 153 not continued after change of line.
- 166 ff.: See comment on M 46 ff.
- 167–170 l: Slur from A; in FECO division of slur between M 168f., probably because in A change of line at this place; FESO follows FECO.
- 171 f. u: Slur in upper voice after change of measure from A, FECO; in FESO, apparently mistakenly, extends only to 2nd note of M 172.
- 174: See comment on M 54.
- 174f. l: Slur at change of measure only in A; missing in FECO, FESO.
- 183 l: 2nd > from A; missing by error in FECO, FESO.
- 188 l: Slurring of *bb*–*bbb* only in A.
- 188f. u: Slur from A; in FECO, FESO division of slur between both measures; but see parallel passage at M 68f. as well as left hand.
- 189: *f* from A, FECO; in FESO not notated, perhaps obstructed by the *in tempo* (missing in A, FECO), which is written between the staves.
- 192 u: < from A; in FECO, and then in FESO, erroneously > .
- 214f. u: See comment on M 96.
- 220 l: See comment in version of 1836 for the first note value.
- 221 f. u: See comment in version of 1836 for slurring.

231 u: In FESO division of slur begins at change of measure; perhaps because of change of line at this spot in FECO.

240 u: \succ from A, FECO; in FESO erroneously \leftarrow ; see also M 236.

II Scherzo. Molto comodo

Heading in A: *Promenade.* / *Scherzo* ~~2^a~~. *Promenade*. Before this: *Scherzo.* / *Intermezzo*. Performance marking: *Molto comodo*. Heading in A2: *Energico*, tempo marking: *Vivace*.

In A * after the 4th eighth-note value of M 29; according to this, the first 28 measures would be played with the use of the pedal, even if at the beginning of the movement there is no corresponding indication. Moreover, in A, A2 *Pedale* on 3rd beat in M 31, in A2 * on 3rd beat in M 32. In FESO this movement contains no pedal marking except for the middle section.

Upbeat: Slurs could be read as starting from the appoggiatura note in A and FESO. But in the further course of the movement, they generally start on the main note. Obviously the inclusion of the grace note is intended.

1f., 5f. u: Slurring of gb^1-f^1 and cb^2-bb^1 from A2; missing in A, FESO; but see left hand.

9f. l: Tie here and at M 172f. $db-db$ added by analogy to M 49f. and 212f.; see also M 13f. In A and A2, however, one even finds staccato markings.

9–68: The repetition of these measures at M 172–231 is not written out in A. This means that Schumann wanted the two sections to be identical; in FESO however, there are a few divergences which have been retained but not listed in detail.

18 u: In A, FESO staccato on 1st note; also occasionally found at analogous passages.

27, 190 u: In FESO $>$ at f^3 ; reading error of the engraver, who erroneously assigned the $>$ to the octave Ab_1/Ab in M 18, written exactly above it in A.

28, 191 l: Arpeggio only in A.

37, 200 u: Notes in small print from A2; missing in A, FESO. In A tying of the notes ab^1/bb^1 at the end of M 36, but tie is not continued after the change of line in M 37.

39f., 202f. l: 3rd and 4th notes of the upper voice from FESO; in A originally as reproduced, but then crossed out and notated a third lower.

52f., 215f. u: In A the two chords before and after the bar line contain the note c^2 in addition. Since both chords are crossed out and hard to decipher, this note might just be missing by accident in FESO. But slight traces of correction are discernible at both places in FESO, especially in later editions.

54, 217 l: Chord on 1st beat from FESO; in A without the upper octave f^1 .

54–56, 217–219: \leftarrow only in A.

67, 230 u: Lower octave of the 5th chord in A corrected from f^1 to gb^1 , to which even the note name *ges* (gb) was added. Precisely this specification suggests, however, that Schumann changed his mind again; it was impossible to misunderstand the correction.

76: In A *Intermezzo. Molto teneramente* above the staff of the right hand, *Feu d'ange* (Angelic Fire) below that of the left hand.

84–91 l: Pedal marking as such only in FESO.

In A T 88–91 ♩ only on each 1st beat.

111 l: $>$ from A; missing in FESO.

112: *p* in FESO on 1st beat of M 113, in A *pp* on 3rd beat of M 113 instead.

119 u: Staccati from A; missing in FESO.

120–125 l: Pedal marking only in FESO.

124 u: *sf* only in A; see also $>$ in M 88.

134f. u: Slur from A; in FESO only in M 134; but see analogous passage at M 98f.

138 l: In FESO staccato dots mistakenly also on 2nd, 4th and 6th ♩ ; but see M 139.

147 u: The two $>$ only in A.

156 u: In FESO $>$ on 1st beat; reading error of the engraver, who falsely assigned the $>$ to the note Eb in M 148 notated directly above it in A (in A still $>$ instead of \wedge). The

> notated in FESO at the 1st note of the left hand is no doubt only an adjustment to this false > of the right hand.

162 l: *sf* only in FESO, and its positioning not entirely clear; it could also be read as belonging to the 2nd chord of the right hand.

163 l: *sf* only in A; entry of theme!

171: *sf* only in A.

III Quasi Variazioni. Andantino de Clara Wieck

Thema

Original metronome marking in A ♩ = 104, thus considerably faster.

1 l: In A, FECO * at the beginning of the piece; this thus means that the piece is to be played without the use of the pedal at the beginning. This certainly also applies to the version of 1853, even if the marking was omitted in FESO; perhaps it was a bit too incongruous for Schumann after all.

17–20 l: In A, FECO and FESO slur begins at 1st or 2nd note of M 18 probably for reasons of space; but see M 21.

19: In FESO another << ; originally also in FECO, and only imperfectly deleted there; traces of correction by the engraver of FESO apparently misunderstood.

Variation 1

37, 39, 43 u: Notation and dotting of the 2nd chord as such in FESO. In A, FECO the notes g^1, f^1 and b^1/d^2 are each notated without augmentation dot and thus probably to be understood as ♩; the addition of the augmentation dots in FESO could be a mistake.

Variation 2

45f.: See comment on slurring in version of 1836.

56f. l: Slur at change of measure from A, FECO; missing in FESO.

Variation 3

84 u: > only in A; omitted in FECO; but see M 91.

88, 90 u: See comment in version of 1836.

92 u: Short slur at end of measure from A; missing in FECO, FESO.

94 u: Long slur from A; in FECO and, later, in FESO only up to penultimate note d^1 ; in A somewhat unclear.

Variation 4

106 l: > from A, FECO; missing in FESO.

107 l: Slur from A, FECO; missing in FESO.

120: Concerning << see the comment in the version of 1836.

121 l: The two slurs from A; missing in FECO, FESO.

125 u: >> could also be read as > in A; the same in FECO, FESO; but see M 106.

134: In FESO portato slur missing at right hand; entire portato marking at left hand.

IV Prestissimo possibile

Metronome marking in FESO ♩ = 94. Since the number 94 is missing on Mälzel's metronome scale, this must be a mistake; presumably 92 was intended (it is more plausible that the engraver misread the number 2 as 4 rather than 6). Compared with the marking in A (6/16 = 108) and FECO (♩ = 112), this calls for a substantial deceleration, even though the verbal indication *Prestissimo possibile* was retained.

Due to the notation in a different metre (see the version of A, FECO), the rhythmic execution of individual ♩ (e.g. at M 13) or dotted figures such as ♩. (e.g. at M 14) is not unequivocally clear: In A, FECO they always fall together with the third note of the respective 16th-note group of the opposite hand. In FESO (where the 16th-note groups should correctly be given a triplet marking, but significantly are not) they are, however, all notated "correctly," i.e. as duplets against triplets. The editor is of the opinion that this was not intended by Schumann, quite apart from the fact that such refinements would hardly be noticeable in the prestissimo tempo of the movement. The corresponding passages are thus all notated

according to the “rhythmic pattern” of the version of A, FECO.

1f., 5f.: \llcorner missing in FESO each time; but see the analogous passages.

2 u: In FESO staccato on last eighth note; probably a mechanical adjustment to the marking of the preceding measures.

3: *pp* missing here in FESO, at M 329 only *p*; at M 169 *pp* also in A, FESO.

6 l: $>$ only in FECO; but see parallel passage at M 172. $\text{\textcircled{S}}^*$ (only in FESO) somewhat curious on account of the general instruction *Pedale* in M 1. Perhaps the marking is intended to suggest a particularly differentiated pedalling; $*$ thus does not entirely cancel the use of the pedal after M 6, see $*$ in M 9.

9: *p* only in A; missing in FECO.

10 l: 3rd $>$ only in FECO.

11 l: Staccato on 1st note only in A.

12 u: 4th $>$ missing in FESO.

l: The last two staccati are missing in FESO.

15f. u: See comment on M 29–31 in version of 1836.

24 u: First $>$ missing in FESO.

29ff. l: See comment on M 57ff. in version of 1836.

29–33 l: Long slur from FECO; in A extends only to 2nd octave at M 32; in FESO not continued after change of line between M 31f.

35: *rfz* according to the prevailing marking at the analogous passages; here *sf* in the three sources; likewise at M 46, 48, 50, 52, 54, 74, 76 as well as M 78 and 82 (only FESO). M 246 in FESO *fz*.

42 u: 1st note $d b^2$ from FESO; in A, FECO c^2 instead. At the parallel passage in M 208, however, FESO diverges in the same manner from A, FECO (ab^2 instead of g^2), so that one can probably assume an intentional change.

48f. l: See comment on M 94f. in version of 1836.

49 u: \llcorner according to the analogous passages at M 215, 219 and 247; in all three sources mistakenly \gg instead of \llcorner .

50 u: In FESO superfluous $\text{\textcircled{7}}$ after last note; see also comment on M 99 in version of 1836.

51 l: \llcorner in conformity with the analogous passages at M 79, 217, 221 and 245; in all three sources mistakenly \gg instead of \llcorner .

56 u: See comment on M 110f. in version of 1836.

57–59 l: In FECO staccato on 1st note of M 58f.; FESO supplements it also in M 57; probably an error. See the slurs in M 85–87 and the slashes between the bass note and the chord in A, FECO here and at all analogous passages; they are probably intended to suggest a very close connection where a genuine legato is not possible.

60 u: \llcorner missing in FESO, staccato on 3rd note in FESO not adopted, as singular occurrence. However, it is notated at most analogous passages in A, but is consistently missing in FECO. It is unclear why it suddenly appears in FESO, and only this one time; was it perhaps added by Schumann?

60–73: See comment on M 118–137 in version of 1836.

62 u: Long slur missing in FESO; slur at M 63 begins on 1st beat.

69 l: \llcorner from A; in FECO, FESO mistakenly \gg .

76f. l: Tie bb^1 – bb^1 missing in FESO.

81 l: See comment on M 160f. in version of 1836.

84 u: See comment on M 110f. in version of 1836.


94, 96: In FESO only one \llcorner between the staves in each instance; but see the analogous passages.






94f. u: In FECO, FESO one unbroken slur; but see the analogous passages.

102f. l: See comment on M 202–204 in version of 1836.

110 l: *Pedale* only in A; missing in FECO, FESO, where, however, $*$ is notated, albeit not until the middle of M 112.

112–115 u: Slurring in FECO, FESO

; omitted, since clearly a hold-over

- from the “polyphonic” notation in the version of 1836 () , which, however, is “corrupted” at this passage in FECO (see comment on M 222–228 in version of 1836).
- 116, 118 l: 2nd > missing in FESO.
- 116, 282 l: Notation of the first two  from FESO; in A, FECO ; it cannot be excluded that this notation should maintain its validity, and that it only fell victim to the new metre.
- 132 l: See comment on M 263 in version of 1836.
- 135 u: See comment on M 269 in version of 1836.
- 144 l: > missing in FESO.
- 145 l: See comment on M 288f. in version of 1836.
- 197 l: See comment on M 57ff. in version of 1836.
- 208 u: See the comment on M 42.
- 214–216 u: Slur from A; in FECO only extends to 1st note of M 216; but see the analogous passages.
- 220 u: > only in A, FECO; missing in FESO.
- 222 u: See comment on M 110f. in version of 1836.
- 227 l: < only in A, FECO; missing in FESO.
- 229 u: < missing in FESO.
- 229, 232f. l: < missing in FESO.
- 230 u: In FESO mistakenly > instead of < ; slip resulting from the mirror-image engraving; see the analogous passages.
- 234 l: < only in A, FECO.
- 240, 244 u: Closing note in FESO mistakenly  instead of .
- 243 u: < missing in FESO.
- 250f. u: See comment on M 110f. in version of 1836.
- 254f. l: One single slur in FESO; but see the analogous passages.
- 255 l, 257 u, 261, 268, 272 l: < missing in FESO.
- 276f. l: Long slur from A; missing in FECO, FESO.
- 281 u: Third to last note in FESO mistakenly *ab*³ instead of *f*³; but see parallel passage at M 115 as well as A and FECO.
- 282: See comment on M 561 in version of 1836.
- 288 l: < missing in FESO.
- 290–294 u: In FESO division of slur between M 291 and 292; but see the analogous passages.
- 303 f. l: In FECO, FESO < ; not adopted, as singular occurrence.
- 306–309 u: The short slurs over *a–bb* each time are only in A, FECO; see parallel passage at M 140–143.
- 324 f. l: Slurs at M 324 and first slur of M 325 missing in FESO.
- 326: See comment on M 649 in version of 1836.
- 327: *Tempo I*^o only in A; missing in FECO, but logical after the *rall.* in the preceding measure.
- 329: See comment on M 3.
- 331 u: See comment on M 658 in version of 1836.
- 332 l: * missing in FESO.
- 335 u: FESO retains slurring of 1st–3rd notes of the upper voice; a holdover from FECO; all other slurs are eliminated.
- 340 f. u: Slurs in the middle voice only in A.
- 343 u: First > missing in FESO.
- 350 u: 2nd > missing in FESO.

Remagen, spring 2008
Ernst Hertrich

Kinderszenen op. 15

Sources

- A1 Autograph of no. 1. Zwickau, Robert-Schumann-Haus, shelfmark 3702-A1. Head title: *Aus den Kinderszenen*. Bottom left dating of the dedicatory autograph: *Dresden, / 16ten Februar 1848*. Bottom right: *Für Marie mit den herzlichsten Wünschen / Robert Schumann*. Album leaf for Schumann’s sister-in-law Marie Wieck.

A2 Autograph of no. 9. Washington, Library of Congress, shelfmark ML96.S415. First manuscript, still containing many divergences from the printed version; the leaf also contains the incipit to no. 6 as well as several pieces later published in op. 124.

The current location of an album leaf of 1842 containing a fair copy of no. 6 *Wichtige Begebenheit* is unknown.

FE1 First edition. Leipzig, Breitkopf & Härtel, plate number 6016, published in late February 1839. Title: *Kinderszenen. / LEICHTE / STÜCKE / FÜR DAS / Pianoforte / componirt / von / Robert Schumann. / Op. 15. / Eigentum der Verleger. / LEIPZIG / BEI / Breitkopf & Härtel. / Pr. 20 Gr. / Eingetragen in das Vereins-Archiv. / 6016. / Lith. bei Fr. Krätzschmer.* As Schumann had requested, the “wide margins” were filled in “with borders,” namely with a blue ornamental border. Strangely, the publisher did not give Schumann the opportunity to correct the proofs. The first printing thus still contains many errors and is essentially a non-authorised source.

DL Dedicatory copy of the first edition (FE1) for Franz Liszt. Zwickau, Robert-Schumann-Haus, shelfmark 93.77-D1/A4. Title page without indication of price, thus a pre-publication copy. Handwritten dedication on the title page, bottom right: *An F. Liszt / in Freundschaft / R. Schumann / Wien, d. 18ten März.* The publisher had sent Schumann six printed copies of the first edition on 16 February 1839, which, as was the custom, did not yet contain an indication of the price. After he had corrected a number of errors in it by hand, Schumann had one of these copies sent to Franz Liszt on 19 March 1839 through the intermediary of the Viennese pub-

lisher Haslinger. It is particularly important since a list of errata that Schumann had sent “by post-coach” (“Briefbuch” no. 509) to Breitkopf on 2 March, immediately after receiving the first copies, has been lost. It was presumably drawn up in great haste and apparently did not contain all the corrections from Liszt’s copy. In any event, some of these corrections were not carried over into the later printings.

FE2 Later, corrected printing of the first edition. Published in March 1839. On 14 March 1839 Breitkopf informed Schumann: “We had the errors contained in the *Kinderszenen* corrected according to your instructions.” Thus the new, corrected edition was, at least theoretically, already available in mid March. Nevertheless, the corrections entered into DL were only partially taken into consideration. What is new in the corrected print are the metronome markings and pedal signs at the beginning of the individual pieces (except for no. 7, where the pedal marking in M 1 was already to be found in the first printings). However, FE2 was also not completely free of errors. While Schumann thanked the publisher Breitkopf & Härtel in a letter dated 15 November 1853 for sending him two copies of the *Kinderszenen*, he complained that “the two old errors had been left there” (see individual comments, comment on no. 11, M 36, and no. 13, M 20). Schumann’s personal copy, Zwickau, Robert-Schumann-Haus, shelfmark 4501/Bd. 3-D1/A4, is a copy of the 1853 printing. Flyleaf: *Leipzig 1838.* The musical text is identical with that of the edition of 1839. It contains a number of handwritten entries, probably from Clara Schumann, which correct a few further errors not marked in DL.

A new engraving of the *Kinderszenen* (with narrower, green ornamental border) was probably not published until after 1868.

About this edition

As it emerges from his letter to Clara of 17 March 1838, Schumann “selected” the 13 published numbers of the *Kinderszenen* from originally 30 pieces. An all-encompassing autograph thus possibly never existed. However, in a letter to Clara dated 17/18 March 1838 and in a diary entry of 20 March, Schumann mentions that the *Kinderszenen* had been written out “entirely in fair copy.” It is not known whether an autograph or a copy served as the engraver’s copy for the first edition FE1. Schumann’s letter of 2 March 1839 to Breitkopf & Härtel, in which he imputed to the “awful manuscript” the many errors in the first copies that he had received, seems to suggest that he had sent the publisher autograph sheets as the engraver’s copies. A scribal copy would hardly have deserved the epithet “awful manuscript.”

Since there are no extant autographs, the corrected first edition FE2 must be seen as the sole primary source. This, however, does not simplify the source situation: it was essential both to track down all the errors in this edition (neither in DL nor in FE2 have all the errors been discovered) as well as to proceed very cautiously – given the lack of manuscript sources – and avoid intervening too strongly in the text of the primary source.

Many errors in FE1 resulted from the fact that the repeats of short sections were often fully printed out there. This was obviously not the case in the sources, since Schumann, upon sending the manuscripts to Breitkopf on 21 March 1838, estimated that there “would be about ten to eleven plates.” The reason for the artificial expansion of the volume to 20 pages is probably to be found in financial considerations on the part of the publisher. The full printing of the repeats changed not only the (visual) proportions of the pieces,

but also gave rise to textual differences in the sections in question, which show up many little divergences when compared with one another. In this Urtext edition, we have reproduced the (presumed) original form of the manuscript sources.

With respect to the metronome and pedal indications that first appeared in FE2, it seems likely that a list of these addenda, along with the errata, was contained in the lost correction sheet. However, the sole surviving copy of FE1 next to DL (Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin · Preußischer Kulturbesitz) contains a note from its former owner, Schumann’s friend Otto Böhme, according to which the “metronomisation of the *Kinderszenen* not only did not stem from R. Schumann, but was also made without his knowledge and without prior consultation.” Yet this does by no means prove that the metronome numbers were added against the composer’s will. After all, in late January 1839 Schumann inquired of Joseph Doppler where he could purchase a metronome. In a letter dated 24 January, Doppler referred him to Johann Nepomuk Mälzel, who had developed the metronome in Beethoven’s time and was still living in Vienna. Schumann probably acquired a metronome in late January or early February 1839; the metronomisation of the *Kinderszenen* possibly stands in some kind of connection with this. It is all too understandable that Schumann did not enter the metronome numbers into Liszt’s dedicatory copy, since the virtuoso would surely have been mystified by such a prescription of the tempo.



Present-day pianists are often perplexed by the metronome numbers, although they fully harmonise with the understanding of tempo in Schumann’s day (see the short essay by Michael Struck, *Träumerei und zahllose Probleme. Zur leidigen Tempofrage in Robert Schumanns Kinderszenen*, in: *Schumanniana nova: Festschrift für Gerd Nauhaus zum 60. Geburtstag*, ed. by Bernhard R. Appel/Ute Bär/Matthias Wendt, Sinzig, 2002).

Signs placed in parentheses are missing in the sources. The tempo indications to nos. 4, 12 and 13 in Liszt's dedication copy were probably deliberately left out of the edition; they are indicated in footnotes at the appropriate places in the score.

Individual comments

No. 1 Von fremden Ländern und Menschen

Tempo marking in A1 *Allegretto*.

A lively discussion has arisen concerning the execution of the  in connection with the triplets (M 2, 4, 6 etc.). In A1 the respective note heads are placed one above the other in M 2, 6, 14 and 20, but this might be due simply to hasty writing. In FE all  are notated after the last triplet eighth.

5f. u: In A1 slur divided at change of measure; likewise M 20f.

7f., 20ff.: No  notated in A1.

14: No fermatas in A1.

20 u: 2nd note c^1 instead of e^1 in A1.

No. 2 Curiose Geschichte

Repeats printed out in FE2.


19 u: In FE2 slur in middle part only to third-to-last note for lack of space.

No. 3 Hasche-Mann

15 u: In FE2 quarter-note stem in second-beat chord only for upper note e^2 .

l: In FE2 extra quarter-note stem for octave F^\sharp/f^\sharp is missing.



No. 4 Bittendes Kind

2 u: Slur only up to  in FE2; but see also all analogous passages.


No. 5 Glückes genug


Repeats printed out in FE2.

l u: In FE2 slur broken at change of measure; perhaps because of the repeat sign that was presumably present in the manuscript source? Unbroken at the repeat. See also M 9f.

2 u: In FE1 at third-to-last  originally  before f^1 ; crossed out by Schumann in DL; corrected in FE2. – Staccato added by hand in the personal copy.

5 l: Slur in FE2 begins at main note the first time.


7 u: In FE1 4th  with lower note e^1 instead of d^1 ; no correction in DL, but corrected in FE2.

8: *pp* added by hand at last  in the personal copy.


11 u: Articulation at the first two notes only handwritten in the personal copy.


16: The indication *D.C.* at the end of the piece might be a remnant of the manuscript source, in which the repeat was presumably not written out.

No. 6 Wichtige Begebenheit

1: In A2  instead of dotting in the incipit. The dotting is thus to be taken very sharply.


7, 23 l: In FE1 the 2nd octave is a third too low; corrected by Schumann in DL. In FE2 correct each time.

12, 13 u: In FE2  erroneously before d^1 instead of c^1 .

15 u: In FE2  at 4th chord erroneously before a instead of g .

No. 7 Träumerei

6f. l: In DL tie $a-a$ added in Schumann's hand; subsequently printed in FE2.

15 u: In FE2 end of slur in middle part very indistinct for lack of space; seems to extend to 4th  g^1 in the upper staff.

18f. u: Tie $f-f$ only by hand in DL.

23f. u: Tie d^1-d^1 added in Schumann's hand in DL; subsequently printed in E2.

No. 8 Am Camin

8 l: In FE1 1st note d . Corrected by hand to f in DL. Left uncorrected in FE2.

25f. u: In FE2 change of line after M 25; no doubt the reason why the beginning of the tie c^2-c^2 is missing. End of tie clearly notated after change of line, however.

No. 9 Ritter vom Steckenpferd

Performance direction in A2: *Mit Humor*.

9: *f* on 1st beat in A2.

11–14: < from middle of M 11 in A2.

13 l: Slur *d–d*¹ missing in FE1; subsequently printed in FE2. – *a/g* at 3rd beat, corrected by hand to octave *G/g* in DL. FE2 correct.



No. 10 Fast zu ernst

Repeat printed out at T 9–28 in FE2.


14 u: Erroneously *x* instead of *#* in FE2.

15 l: In FE2 1st note erroneously *f#* instead of *d#* the second time.

23 u: 3rd note *b* instead of *c#*¹ in FE1; corrected by hand in DL; correct in FE2.

27 u: In FE1, *seconda volta*,  instead of  in the middle part; left uncorrected both in DL and FE2.

No. 11 Fürchtenmachen

12 l: Penultimate note notated one  too late in FE2.

17 u: The lower two notes of the 1st chord are a third too low in FE1; corrected by hand in DL. Correct in FE2.

21, 24: No repeat sign in FE2; added by hand in the personal copy.

29 u: Slur in FE2 begins by mistake at the note *b* in the lower staff.


36: Retroactive repeat signs printed crossed out by hand in the personal copy. Schumann requested this correction in a letter to Breitkopf dated 15 November 1853.

38 l: 2nd printed note *G*₁ corrected by hand to *B*₁ in the personal copy.

40 u: Staccato in FE1 on 3rd chord, no ties; corrected by hand in DL. Correct in FE2.

No. 12 Kind im Einschlummern

18f. u, 19f. u: Ties *c#*¹–*c#*¹ and *g#*¹–*g#*¹ only by hand in DL.

22 l: Slur in FE2 only up to 2nd  *g*. See right hand as well as M 24.

28 u: Syllable “ri” of *ritardando* missing in FE2. This could mean that the *ritard.* is to begin before M 28.

29 l: In FE1 last note is *e*¹; corrected in DL by hand to *g*¹. Correct in FE2.

No. 13 Der Dichter spricht

10 u: In FE2 last note mistakenly whole note.

20 u: FE1 has 2nd note *A* instead of *c*. In DL corrected by Schumann. FE2 remains uncorrected; instead, the lowest note of the right hand has been corrected from *c*¹ to *a* – possibly due to an ambivalent instruction in the lost list of errata. On 15 November 1853 Schumann informed the publisher that in the new edition of the *Kinderszenen* “the two old errors had been left,” namely those in no. 11 M 36 (see above) and in no. 13 M 20, “the 2nd chord, where there should be a *c* instead of the low *a* in the right hand.” Curiously, Schumann did not object to the note *A* in the bass, which he had corrected to *c* in DL. To a certain extent, the correction request of 1853 contradicts the handwritten correction in DL: analogously to M 22 one would rather expect an *a* in the right hand to the *c* in the bass. In view of the fact that each of the four extant sources – FE1, DL, FE2 and letter with errata – offers a different version, it is impossible to provide a definitive solution. One hypothesis is that Schumann had requested the correction in the right hand in the lost errata sheet (see above), but mistakenly not the corrections in the left hand (or the engraver forgot to carry them out). But then he would have rejected his original intent again in the correction indication in the letter of 1853. The later variant is reproduced in our musical text, which is more or less the ultimate version authorised by Schumann. Nevertheless, the version from DL certainly warrants consideration as well.

Remagen, summer 2007
Ernst Hertrich

Kreisleriana op. 16

Sources

- C Copy of no. 1, in the hand of Schumann's friend, Friederike Serre. Toronto, Royal Ontario Museum, shelfmark R.S. Williams Collection 934.43.213. Schumann's annotation at the bottom of page 1 reads: *Mit herzlichem Gruß u. der Bitte, das Blatt nicht der Majorin Serre zu zeigen, / die es copirt hat. Bald hoffe ich Sie zu sehen, – es geht alles sehr gut. / Lpz. 16 Mar 38. Ihr Schumann.* (With fond greetings and the request not to show this leaf to "Majorin" Serre / who copied it out. I hope to see you soon, – everything is going very well. / Leipzig, 16 March 1838. Your Schumann.) The manuscript contains a preliminary stage that departs from the final version in many passages. As a result, it was of minor significance for the purposes of our edition.
- E1 First edition. Vienna, Tobias Haslinger, plate numbers p. 2 "(7570.)", pp. 3ff. "T. H. 7570", published in September 1838. Title: *Kreisleriana. / FANTASIEN / für / Piano-Forte. / Seinem Freunde / HERRN F. CHOPIN / zugeeignet / von / ROBERT SCHUMANN. / 16tes Werk. / Eigentum des Verlegers. / Eingetragen in das Archiv der vereinigten Musikalienhändler. / [left:] N^o 7570. [right:] Preis $\frac{f. 2.30x C.M.}{T.1.16gr.}$. / Wien, bei Tobias Haslinger, / k. k. Hof- und priv. Kunst- und Musikalienhändler, / am Graben N^o. 618, im Erdlen von Trattner'schen Freihofe.* Copy consulted: Schumann's personal copy, Zwickau, Robert Schumann-Haus, shelfmark 4501/Bd. 3-D1/A4.
- E2 Revised second edition. Leipzig, F. Whistling, plate number 559, published in August 1850. Title: *Kreisleriana. / PHANTASIEEN [sic] / für*

das / Piano-Forte. / Seinem Freunde / F. CHOPIN / zugeeignet von / ROBERT SCHUMANN. / Neue Ausgabe. / [left:] 16tes Werk. [right:] 1 2/3 Thlr. / Eigentum des Verlegers. / Leipzig, F. Whistling. / [left:] St. Petersburg, A. Büttner. [right:] Wien, F. Glöggel. / N^o. 559. Copy consulted: Schumann's personal copy, Zwickau, Robert-Schumann-Haus, shelfmark 4501/Bd. 14-D1/A4.

About this edition

The sole primary source is E2, which contains the final version proofread by Schumann. The engraving is relatively free of errors. In a few passages we have added missing signs from E1. Significant departures in E1 are reproduced as ossia passages or footnotes in the main body of our volume.

Signs that are missing in the sources but that are musically necessary or legitimated through analogy have been placed in parentheses.

Individual comments

No. 1

Tempo mark in C: *Presto*.

1: C has *marcato*.

4 l: C reads as in M 20 and 68, i. e. with $c^{\sharp 1}$ on 4th eighth-note value. Perhaps this measure was accidentally omitted in the lost engraver's copy for E1.

15 l: C already starts slur on note 2.

25 ff.: C also has slurs on notes 3–4 and 9–10. The slur on notes 3–4 was left standing in M 46f. of E2 and also in E1, probably by mistake.

No. 2

4: *p* missing in E2.

15 u: E1 has arpeggio on eb^2/g^2 ; overlooked in E2?

16f. l: Slur over bar line missing in E2.

38: 7th 16th note f^1 appears in upper staff in E1 and E2; tie on a^1-a^1 might also be read as a tie on f^1-f^1 .

- 99: E1 has fermatas above bar line of repeat sign.
 107 f. u: > missing in E2.
 109 l: Staccato on final 16th note missing in E2.
 119 u: E1 and E2 stem quarter note $c^{\sharp 1}$ on beat 2 with eighth note f^1 ; however, see M 123.
 127 u: The sources give \flat ; however the *Instructive Ausgabe* of the *Klavier-Werke von Robert Schumann*, edited by Clara Schumann in 1886, has \flat .
 129 l: E2 stems quarter note g^{\sharp} on beat 3 (tied over bar line) with eighth note d^1 .
 146 l: E2 ends slur on note 1.

No. 3

- 4 l: 1st staccato missing in E2.
 8 l: 2nd staccato missing in E2.
 14 u: E1 and E2 place staccato on note 5; ignored in our edition as otherwise unique.
 18–20: E2 places > on final eighth-note value in each measure (midway between the two staves); however, see analogous passage in M 102–104.
 22: E1 positions f between 3rd and 4th eighth-notes values; probably placed on 4th eighth-note value in E2 for this reason; however, see M 106.
 24 u: > missing in E2.
 l: Staccato missing in E2.
 34: < missing in E2; however, see analogous passage in M 69 f.
 62 f. l: E2 postpones beginning of slur to beat 1 of M 63; however, see M 66 f. – Accent mark on ebb^1 missing in E2.
 84 l: Staccato missing in E2.
 86: 1st > occurs only in E1.
 105 f. l: Tie added in the personal copy; see M 21 f.
 110 l: Staccato in left hand missing in E2.
 144–148: Slur on lower voice missing in E2.

No. 4

♯ taken from E1 and E2. Changed to \mathring{C} in the *Instructive Ausgabe*.

- 3 l: Tie from grace note E^{\flat} to principal note missing in E2.
 8: E1 has *pp*; overlooked in E2?
 u: E1 and E2 give f^2 as a metrically incorrect half note.
 17 u: E2 ends slur on note 4; however, see M 15.
 23 l: E2 places *Pedal* on final chord owing to shortage of space.

No. 5

- 2 u: 1st staccato missing in E2.
 33 u: E1 and E2 already start slur on beat 1; tie on $f^{\sharp 1}$ – $f^{\sharp 1}$ missing in E2; however, see analogous passage in M 123.
 34 f. u: E1 and E2 postpone start of lower slur to beat 1 of M 35, probably owing to shortage of space; see M 125.
 100: E1 and E2 extend slurs to beat 1 of M 101; however, see surrounding measures.
 115 u: E1 and E2 stem quarter note c^2 with eighth note f^2 .
 122 u: E1 and E2 end slur on note 2; however, see analogous measures.
 123 f. u: Slur missing in E2.
 136 u: E1 and E2 give note 1 as quarter note; however, see analogous measures.
 137 l: > missing in E2.

No. 6

- 3 u: E1 and E2 tie notes 1–3; however, see M 13 f.
 6: Both sources place 32nd note g in right hand exactly on note 4 of quintuplet; E1 does same with final 32nd note in left hand. However, 32nd note d^1 in M 7 is metrically accurate in both sources. Both forms of execution are conceivable.
 8 u: E1 and E2 postpone beginning of first slur to note 3; however, see analogous measures. – Slur at end of measure in E1 and E2 could also be read as extending to beat 1 of M 9; however, see M 9.
 32 u: Quarter-note stem missing on note 1 (d^2).

39 l: The slur over the bar line from the upper to the lower staff raises the question of whether the d^1 should or should not be struck again. There is no simple answer to the question, but it is more likely that the slur overrides the tie on d^1 – d^1 in the upper staff.

No. 7

38, 86 u: E1 places the final 16th note f^1 exactly above the penultimate note of the quintuplet. The notation is metrically correct in E2; however, the possibility cannot be excluded that the notation in E1 is intended.

69 l: E1 and E2 give note 1 as c instead of g . Probably a mistake; see the analogous passages in M 9, 11 and 71.

No. 8

28 l: Arpeggio on 2nd octave taken from E1 and E2; missing in analogous measures 32, 36 and 40.

56 u: E1 and E2 give note 4 as $b\flat$ instead of g ; engraver's error; see M 124. – 2nd staccato missing in E2.

90 l: $>$ missing in E2.

125: E1 and E2 postpone p to note 2 owing to shortage of space.

Conflicting readings in E1

No. 1

25: pp instead of p , and already on upbeat.

34 f. u: Slur over bar line missing.

40: *ritard.* from 16th note 4.

No. 2

Upbeat: mf instead of p .

1, 3: \llcorner instead of $\llcorner\triangleright$; same in all analogous measures.

2, 4: f instead of sf ; same in all analogous measures.

20 u: *Im Tempo* missing.

28: *ritard.* from beat 1.

41 l: Accent on final note.

47 u: Sixth 16th note reads $g\flat$ instead of $a\flat$.

82: *ritard.* from 3rd eighth-note value.

88 f. u: Slur undivided; see analogous passage in M 34 f., where, however, the slur-ring also conflicts with left hand.

91 u: Slur begins before line break, but new slur in M 92 not open to the left.

117: *ritard.* on final note.

121, 125: *ritard.* from beat 3.

146: *ritard.* from beat 1.

162: *Adagio* from beat 1.

No. 3

31: *ritard.* from beat 2.

40, 76: *ritard.* on quintuplet.

55: *ritard.* from 2nd eighth-note value.

64: *ritard.* from beat 1.

68 f. u: *Im Tempo* missing.

136 ff., 144 ff., 152 ff.: $>$ instead of \wedge .

No. 4

1 u: Slur divided on notes 1–2 and 3–4; portato dots added on notes 1 and 2. – \llcorner instead of $\llcorner\triangleright$. Analogous \llcorner also occurs in M 4 and 24.

2: \llcorner on 3rd and 4th eighth-note values.

4: f instead of *cresc.*; $>$ on chords 2, 3 and 5.

8: *ritard.* from 2nd eighth-note value.

17: *ritard.* from 3rd quarter-note value. – pp instead of p .

21: *ritard.* from eighth note b^2 .

24: $>$ on penultimate chord.

25: \triangleright on 3rd and 4th eighth-note values.

No. 5

70 a: *Im Tempo* missing; same in M 93.

140: *ritardando* from beat 1.

No. 6

5 f.: *Im Tempo* missing; same in M 11 and 17.

9: \llcorner on 2nd quintuplet.

15: $>$ on beat 4.

19: No change of time signature, but following measures notated in 6/8.

20, 22, 26: *ritard.* from middle of each measure.

23 u: \llcorner in 2nd half of measure.

28 u: $>$ on final note and slur to note 1 of next measure.

38: *Adagio* from beat 1.

No. 7

66 l: First chord has additional d^2 ; traces of correction in E2.

105: *ritard.* from beat 1.

No. 8

15, 63, 131: *ritard.* from beat 1.

Schalkenbach, spring 2004

Ernst Hertrich